

**Village of Lancaster**  
**Historic Preservation Commission**  
Municipal Building, Lancaster NY

**MEETING MINUTES**  
**August 11, 2021**

**I. Attendance/Call to Order**

The meeting was called to order at 7:00PM by Acting Chair J. Keefe. J. Kacala led the HPC in the Pledge of Allegiance.

*Board Members*

Campbell, S.	<u>X</u>
Chaves Yates, C.	<u>exc.</u>
Eckert, E.	<u>X</u>
Kacala, J.	<u>X</u>
Keefe, J. (Acting Chair)	<u>X</u>
Meyer, M. (Chair)	<u>exc.</u>
Mikula, E.	<u>X</u>
Stonebraker, N. (Alt.)	<u>X</u>
Russ, M. (Alt.)	<u>exc.</u>
Allein, J (Planning Commission Liaison)	<u>X</u>
Marshall, S. (Code Enforcement Officer)	<u>exc.</u>
Eckert, E. (Secretary)	<u>X</u>

Roll call indicated that six (6) voting members were present and a quorum existed.

**II. Public Hearings**

a. 5512 Broadway – Steven and Ashley Kohlhagen – Replacement siding

Steven Kohlhagen was present at the meeting. He presented additional information to add to the submitted COA application, including a quote for hardie board/fiber cement siding. He described that since the last meeting, there have been heavy rains and water has infiltrated the exterior walls of the house during those rains. E. Eckert stated that in reading through other sources, she felt that it would be acceptable to allow the owner to install vinyl siding over the existing wood siding. She also stated that to her, the siding is not a significant historic feature of the house but the porches were and that she would hope that if the HPC approves the vinyl siding on the main house, any work done to the porches would be wood and replacement in kind. S. Campbell stated that the Design Guidelines recommend not using vinyl as a replacement for wood signs. She also researched other local HPCs Design Guidelines, which also state that vinyl should not be used as a replacement for wood siding. J. Kacala asked Mr. Kohlhagen if it was made clear when he purchased the house that it was located within the Historic District, e stated that it was. Mr. Kohlhagen pointed out several of the photos of the deteriorated siding, and told the Commission that he has already discovers mold on the inside in several places, presumably from moisture infiltration from the exterior. E. Eckert expressed concern that the sheathing may be rotten beneath the wood siding and if the wood siding remains, that moisture will remain and the integrity of the house structure itself may be compromised. It was her opinion that replacing the siding could protect the

**Village of Lancaster**  
**Historic Preservation Commission**  
Municipal Building, Lancaster NY

structure from further damage down the line. She cited NPS Preservation Brief 8: Aluminum and Vinyl Siding on Historic Buildings that the following conditions were met, “the existing siding is so deteriorated or damaged that it cannot be repaired and the substitute material can be installed without irreversible damaging or obscuring the architectural features and trim of the building.” Mr. Kohlhagen stated that the trim boards beneath the roof eaves would be wrapped in aluminum to retain their appearance. There was no further discussion.

MOTION: E. Eckert made a motion to approve the COA with the conditions stated: the existing porch and porch siding is to remain the same, the exposure dimension and texture of the replacement siding is to match the existing wood siding to the extent possible, all trim boards such as at corners, around windows and at roof trim boards are to be wrapped in aluminum and not change the appearance of this trim to the extent possible. Second by J. Kacala.

MOTION APPROVED: In a vote of five (5) ayes to one (1) nays. S. Campbell voted against.

*Justification: Per NPS Preservation Brief 8: Aluminum and Vinyl Siding on Historic Buildings, “For historic residential buildings, aluminum or vinyl siding may be an acceptable alternative only if (1) the existing siding is so deteriorated or damaged that it cannot be repaired; (2) the substitute material can be installed without irreversibly damaging or obscuring the architectural features and trim of the building; and (3) the substitute material can match the historic material in size, profile and finish so that there is no change in the character of the historic building.” The Commission felt that these conditions were met in this case.*

**b. 20 School Street – Jeffrey Godfrey – Concrete Paving**

Jeffrey Godfrey was present at the meeting. It was discussed that this proposed work needs to go before the Planning Commission as well. He explained plans to replace the main driveway with asphalt as well as add additional paving at the front of the house. S. Campbell asked why the additional paving could not go back behind the house – Mr. Godfrey stated that it is very steep and goes back to the creek behind the house. There was no further discussion.

MOTION: J. Keefe made a motion to table the COA. Second by N. Stonebraker.

MOTION APPROVED: In a vote of six (6) ayes to zero nays.

**III. Approval of Meeting Minutes**

**a. *July 14, 2021 (Regular Meeting)***

MOTION: E. Mikula made a motion to approve the minutes as amended. Second by J. Kacala.

MOTION APPROVED: In a vote of six (6) ayes to zero (0) nays.

**IV. Administrative Matters**

**a. Public comment on matters of interest**

**b. New property issues**

i. New sign at the corner of Broadway and Pac Way without COA.

ii. Central Ave and Clark St. Parking lot – J. Keefe stated that the dumpsters are still a mess.

**c. Ongoing property issues**

i. 5622 Broadway – *New citation has been issued.*

ii. 5500 Broadway (📍♥ Massage) – *S. Marshall is sending a new notice.*

**Village of Lancaster**  
**Historic Preservation Commission**  
Municipal Building, Lancaster NY

- iii. 77 Central Ave. – *Work in progress.*
  - iv. 81 Central Ave – *Work in progress.*
  - v. 25 Central Ave – *S. Marshall is sending a new notice.*
  - vi. 5572 Broadway – *S. Marshall is sending a new citation.*
  - vii. 42 Aurora St. (Black Sheep) – *COA for porch work has been approved. No progress has been made on the work. S. Marshall is sending a new notice on the sign.*
  - viii. 5558 Broadway – *S. Marshall stated that the Building Department is checking on compliance.*
  - ix. Broadway and Legion Pkwy – *Temporary signs for Elks Club Cruise Nights and various events. – S. Marshall has ordered these signs to be removed by DPW, should be gone by 8/16.*
  - x. 5413 Broadway (Picasso’s Pizza) – *S. Marshall sent a second notice, expecting appearance ticket in court in September.*
  - xi. 5482 Broadway – *S. Marshall is working with the Building Department to address. The permit was issued in error.*
- d. Communications/Reports - *none*
  - e. Treasurer’s Report - *none*
  - f. Village Newsletter – *Next newsletter is November.*

**V. Old Business:**

- a. Model Law – Meeting scheduled for 8/26 with A. Herdzik.

**VI. New Business**

- a. Training Opportunities
  - i. NAPC Summer Short Course – August 24 & 25
  - ii. PastForward: National Preservation Conference – November 3-6
  - iii. Statewide Preservation Conference – November 16 -18

**VII. Next Meeting: September 8, 2021 @ 7:00pm.**

**VIII. Adjourn (8:01pm)**

MOTION: S. Campbell moved to adjourn the meeting. Second by E. Eckert.  
MOTION APPROVED: In a vote of six (6) ayes to zero (0) nays.